

# TEXAS INDIGENT DEFENSE COMMISSION

# **Fiscal Monitoring Report**

Williamson County, Texas

**FY 2015 Indigent Defense Expenses** 

**Final Report** 

**October 4, 2016** 

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	3
Summary of Findings	3
Objective	3
Scope	3
Methodology	3
DETAILED REPORT	
BACKGROUND INFORMATION	4
County Background	4
Commission Background	
Formula Grant	
Discretionary Grant	
DETAILED FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	5
APPENDIXES	7
APPENDIX A – INDIGENT DEFENSE EXPENDITURE REPORT	8
APPENDIX B - OBJECTIVE, SCOPE, METHODOLOGY and CRITERIA	10
APPENDIX C – DISTRIBUTION LIST	11

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

Williamson County's on-site fiscal monitoring visit was conducted May 18-19, 2016 with follow-up emails. The fiscal monitor reviewed financial records to determine whether grant funds were spent in accordance with the terms and conditions of the Texas Indigent Defense Commission grants.

The expenditure period of October 1, 2014 to September 30, 2015 (FY2015) was reviewed during the fiscal monitoring visit as well as documents to support the discretionary grant funding.

#### **Summary of Findings**

 General court expenditures were included with the criminal indigent defense expenses in the FY 2015 Indigent Defense Expense Report (IDER) submitted under Texas Government Code Section 79.036 (e).

#### **Objective**

The objectives of this review were to:

- determine whether grant funds were used for authorized purposes in compliance with laws, regulations, and the provisions of the grant;
- validate policies and procedures relating to indigent defense services;
- provide recommendations pertaining to operational efficiency; and
- assist with any questions or concerns on the indigent defense program requirements.

#### **Scope**

The county's indigent defense expenditures were monitored to ensure compliance with applicable laws, regulations, and the provisions of the grants during FY2015. Records provided by the Williamson County Auditor's Office were reviewed.

#### Methodology

To accomplish the objectives, the fiscal monitor met with the County Auditor, Assistant County Auditors and District Judge Donna King. The fiscal monitor reviewed:

- random samples of paid attorney fees for verification;
- accounts payable ledger transactions provided by the Williamson County Auditor's Office;
- IDER and attorney fee schedule;
- public attorney appointment list, attorney applications, attorney criminal and juvenile continuing legal education training documentation, any applicable contracts;
- the county's local indigent defense plan; and
- discretionary grant records.

#### **DETAILED REPORT**

#### **BACKGROUND INFORMATION**

#### **County Background**

Williamson County is located in central Texas. The county is part of the Austin-Round Rock, Texas Metropolitan Statistical Area. The county is located on the Edwards Plateau to the west and the Blackland Prairies to the east. The County serves an estimated population of 483,599. The County seat is Georgetown. Williamson County is a political subdivision of the State of Texas. The County occupies an area of 1,134 square miles, of which 16 square miles is water. The neighboring counties are Bell, Milam, Lee, Bastrop, Travis and Burnet.

#### **Commission Background**

In January 2002, the 77<sup>th</sup> Texas Legislature established the Texas Task Force on Indigent Defense. In May 2011, the 82<sup>nd</sup> Texas Legislature changed the name of the Texas Task Force on Indigent Defense to the Texas Indigent Defense Commission (Commission) effective September 1, 2011. The Commission remains a permanent standing committee of the Texas Judicial Council, and is administratively attached to the Office of Court Administration (OCA).

The Commission provides financial and technical support to counties to develop and maintain quality, cost-effective indigent defense systems that meet the needs of local communities and the requirements of the constitution and state law.

The purpose of the Commission is to promote justice and fairness to all indigent persons accused of criminal conduct, including juvenile respondents, as provided by the laws and constitutions of the United States and the State of Texas. The Commission conducts these reviews based on the directive in Section 79.037(c) Texas Government Code, to "monitor each county that receives a grant and enforce compliance by the county with the conditions of the grant...", as well as Section 173.401(a), Texas Administrative Code, which provides that "the Commission or its designees will monitor the activities of grantees as necessary to ensure that grant funds are used for authorized purposes in compliance with laws, regulations, and the provisions of the grant."

#### **Formula Grant**

The County submitted the FY 2015 indigent defense on-line grant application to assist in the provision of indigent defense services. Williamson County met the formula grant eligibility requirements and was awarded \$304,367 for FY 2015.

#### **Discretionary Grant**

Williamson County received discretionary grant funds for FY 2015 in the amount of \$36,644.30 for the purpose of implementing and training on enhancements to the Odyssey system. These enhancements were recommended improvements from a FY 2012 discretionary grant awarded to Williamson County. A review of these funds was conducted.

#### DETAILED FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

#### **Finding One**

The County included some general court expenditures with the criminal indigent defense expenses in the FY 2015 Indigent Defense Expense Report (IDER) submitted under Texas Government Code Section 79.036 (e). Eight (8) invoices from the expert witness category were reviewed. All eight were for psychological/mental health evaluations. Three of these invoices had attached an Ex Parte Motion from defense counsel seeking the assistance from an expert in the preparation of a defense, which are allowable expenses. Another three invoices included a motion from the defense counsel but these motions were seeking a competency evaluation of the defendant. The remaining two invoices included motions by an assistant district attorney questioning the competency of the defendant to stand trial. A request for a mental health evaluation to determine competency to stand trial is typically a general court expense. The only mental health examinations that are considered indigent defense expenses are those requested by the defense counsel where the results are shared exclusively with the defense team. No mental health evaluations requested by the judge or prosecuting attorney should be reported as indigent defense expenses. Support that the expense is requested by the defense attorney for exclusive use of the results by the defense team should be documented in order to include the expenses on the IDER.

General court expenditures should not be included in the criminal indigent defense expense report. The IDER overstated the county's criminal indigent defense expenditures due to the inclusion of these general court costs. This could mean that the FY 2015 formula grant for Williamson County was greater than would have been authorized if reported without the ineligible expenses. Please refer to the Indigent Defense Expenditure Report Procedure Manual: http://www.tidc.texas.gov/media/40464/fy15-ider-manual.pdf

#### **Recommendation:**

Procedures to identify and record expenses for psychological evaluations requested by the appointed defense counsel for the exclusive use of defense counsel in preparation of a defense should be developed.

#### **County Response:**

#### **Williamson County Action Plan**

The County Auditor's office will review expert witness expenditures and exclude any
expenses related to competency evaluations that are not strictly requests for an expert to
assist in the preparation of the indigent client's defense.
Contact person(s): <u>Julie M. Kiley, First Assistant Auditor</u>
Completion date: Fiscal Year 2016

#### **Additional Comment:**

The fiscal monitor noted that the Single Audit conducted by the independent auditor for FY 2015 had revealed a non-compliance findings regarding continuing legal education (CLE) hours on the Commission grant for the period under review. A discussion with District Judge Donna King during this review explained why the non-compliance happened and what the county has done to correct the issue in the finding. The fiscal monitor found that Williamson County has implemented procedures in FY 2016 to correct the issue; therefore no finding was included in this review.

# **APPENDIXES**

# APPENDIX A – INDIGENT DEFENSE EXPENDITURE REPORT

WILLIAMSON COUNTY INDIGENT DEFENSE EXPENDITURES							
Expenditures	2013	2014	2015				
Population Estimate	455,479	469,417	483,599				
Juvenile Assigned Counsel	\$183,682	\$153,400	\$149,935				
Capital Murder	\$135,434	\$31,000	\$45,003				
Adult Non-Capital Felony Assigned Counsel	\$684,500	\$846,070	\$892,300				
Adult Misdemeanor Assigned Counsel	\$638,756.	\$774,486	\$771,258				
Juvenile Appeals	\$0.00	\$1,658	\$3,045				
Adult Felony Appeals	\$17,450	\$32,159	\$93,426				
Adult Misdemeanor Appeals	\$4,620	\$2,325	\$0.00				
Licensed Investigation	\$18,025	\$22,911	\$24,107				
Expert Witness	\$108,025	\$101,596	\$186,565				
Other Direct Litigation	\$2,419	\$2,099	\$2,917				
Total Court Expenditures	\$1,792,911	\$1,967,705	\$2,168,556				
Administrative Expenditures	\$111,345	\$127,255	\$0.00				
Funds Paid by Participating County to Regional Program	N/A	N/A	N/A				
Total Public Defender Expenditures	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00				
Total Court and Administrative Expenditures	\$1,904,257	\$2,094,960	\$2,168,556				
Formula Grant Disbursement	\$246,082	\$470,511	\$304,367				
Discretionary Disbursement	N/A	N/A	\$36,644				
Reimbursement of Attorney Fees	\$126,942	\$131,440	\$157,443				
Reimbursement by State Comptroller for Writs of Habeas Corpus	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00				
Total Assigned Counsel Cases	5,681	6,020	6,067				

## **Indigent Defense Expenditure Reporting**

Source: Texas Indigent Defense Commission records

Williamson County							
Year	2013	2014	2015	Texas 2015			
Population (Non-Census years are estimates)	455,479	469,417	483,599	27,213,214			
Felony Charges Added (from OCA report)	2,314	2,362	2,686	271,744			
Felony Cases Paid	1,277	1,530	1,659	193,560			
% Felony Charges Defended with Appointed Counsel	55%	65%	62%	71.23%			
Felony Trial Court-Attorney Fees	\$819,934	\$877,070	\$937,303	\$110,036,405			
Total Felony Court Expenditures	\$941,894	\$992,322	\$1,121,334	\$126,091,674			
Misdemeanor Charges Added (from OCA report)	10,512	10,020	8,472	503,299			
Misdemeanor Cases Paid	4,014	4,158	4,089	222,408			
% Misdemeanor Charges Defended with Appointed Counsel	38%	41%	48%	44 %			
Misdemeanor Trial Court Attorney Fees	\$638,756	\$774,486	\$771,258	\$39,141,724			
Total Misdemeanor Court Expenditures	\$643,640	\$785,113	\$790,818	\$40,061,131			
Juvenile Charges Added (from OCA report)	442	460	314	31,813			
Juvenile Cases Paid	378	319	303	41,068			
Juvenile Attorney Fees	\$183,682	\$153,400	\$149,935	\$11,072,434			
Total Juvenile Expenditures	\$185,182	\$153,400	\$154,196	\$11,747,908			
Total Attorney Fees	\$1,664,442	\$1,841,099	\$1,954,967	\$165,942,108			
Total ID Expenditures	\$1,904,257	\$2,094,960	\$2,168,556	\$238,029,838			
Increase In Total Expenditures over Baseline	268%	305%	319%	168%			
Total ID Expenditures per Population	\$4.18	\$4.46	\$4.48	\$8.75			
Commission Formula Grant Disbursement	\$246,082	\$470,511	\$304,367	\$23,931,689			

## **Indigent Defense Expenditure Reporting**

Source: Texas Indigent Defense Commission records

#### APPENDIX B – CRITERIA

#### Criteria

- Uniform Grant Management Standards
- Texas Government Code, Section 79.036. Indigent Defense Information
- Texas Government Code, Section 79.037. Technical Support; Grants
- Code of Criminal Procedures Art 26.04 Procedures for Appointing Counsel
- Code of Criminal Procedures Art 26.05 Compensation of Counsel Appointed to Defend
- Texas Administrative Code Title 1, Part 8, Chapter 174 Subchapter A Rule 174.1
- Texas Administrative Code Title 1, Part 8, Chapter 174 Subchapter A Rule 174.2
- Texas Administrative Code Title 1, Part 8, Chapter 174 Subchapter B Definitions
- FY2015 Indigent Defense Expenditure Report Manual found at: http://www.tidc.texas.gov/media/40464/fy15-ider-manual.pdf

#### APPENDIX C – DISTRIBUTION LIST

Honorable Dan A. Gattis Williamson County County Judge 710 S. Main St., Suite 101 Georgetown, TX 78626

Honorable Betsy Lambeth 425th District Court Judge 405 S. MLK Blvd., Box 5 Williamson County Georgetown, TX 78626

Honorable Suzanne Brooks Local Administrative Statutory County Court Judge Williamson County 405 S. MLK Blvd., Box 5 Georgetown, TX 78626

Mr. David U. Flores County Auditor Williamson County 710 S. Main St., Suite 301 Georgetown, TX 78626

Ms. Julie Kiley Williamson County First Assistant County Auditor 710 S. Main St., Suite 301 Georgetown, TX 78626

Mr. James D. Bethke Executive Director, Texas Indigent Defense Commission 209 W. 14<sup>th</sup> Street, Room 202 Austin, TX 78701

Mr. Wesley Shackelford Deputy Director, Texas Indigent Defense Commission 209 W. 14<sup>th</sup> Street, Room 202 Austin, TX 78701

Mr. Edwin Colfax Grants Program Manager, Texas Indigent Defense Commission 209 W. 14<sup>th</sup> Street, Room 202 Austin, TX 78701